

Instructions for HyENA experiment

Thank you for joining the HyENA experiment! The goal of this experiment is to assign topical units to **Arguments** extracted from a discourse. The **Arguments** are based on opinions of Dutch residents in the context of covid-19. We ask you to select **Topics** that **Arguments** match to in the context of specific proposals.

What you will be reading

In the HyENA experiment you will be a list of **Arguments** created following answers to a questionnaire, where citizens were asked to provide feedback on potential government policies regarding the relaxation of the Covid-19 measures.

In the questionnaire, participants considered possible policy **Options** suggested by the government. If a participant selected an **Option**, they were invited to motivate their choice with a short text comment, which we refer to as an **Argument**. Participants could enter **Arguments** in favor, or opposing **Options**. You will be reading the **Arguments** in reply to a single **Option**.

Lifting corona measures in the Netherlands

The questionnaire was conducted in the Netherlands between 29/04/2020 and 06/05/2020, when partial lockdown measures were in place in the Netherlands. The government wanted to gauge the opinion of the citizens on the eight possible **Options**. Each proposed **Option** came with an additional pressure on the healthcare system as a consequence (percentage in parentheses):

- Nursing and care homes allow visitors. (10-25%)
- Businesses open again, except for hotels, restaurants, cafes and contact professions (barbers, beauticians, etc.). (6-15%)
- Employees in contact professions (barbers, beauticians, etc.) go back to work. (8-15%)
- Young people may come together in groups. (4-8%)
- All restrictions are lifted for people who are immune.) (10-20%)
- Restrictions are lifted in Friesland, Groningen and Drenthe (Northern regions less affected by the virus). (15-30%)
- Social contact within families is allowed again. (6-15%)
- Hotels, restaurants, cafes, and the entertainment industry re-open. (15-25%)

The question you will be answering in the annotation, is:

What arguments are relevant in the context of relaxing COVID-19 measures, for or against a single proposed relaxation measure?

Arguments

Arguments are an intuitive way for people to describe the tradeoffs of decision. More precisely, Arguments are opinions or pieces of evidence that support or object to a decision. They should also adhere to the following criteria:

- Arguments should be addressing a single point at the time.
- Arguments should have a logical structure, where they provide an answer to the *why question*: an argument gives a single reason for or against taking a specific action.
- Argument should be either in support of (Pro) or against a proposed Option.

Arguments follow a template to match the three points given above.

For a Pro argument:

Based on this Motivation, a reason to support this Option is:

For a Con argument:

Based on this Motivation, a reason to refute this Option is:

Topics

Topics are groups of words that represent aspects of a proposal. If a Topic applies to an **Argument**, we can expect the words of that topic, or related words, to show up in the **Argument**. Multiple Topics can apply to **Arguments**. It may also be possible that an **Argument** cannot be matched to a Topic. For more background information, see [here](#).

Examples

Below, we give some example *Arguments in italics* in the context of **putting wind turbines and solar panels on land to battle climate change**.

Consider a list of Topics:

1. land nature view area
2. other abroad reliant country
3. oil electric coal gas
4. danger climate flood ice
5. good renewable power environment

We annotate **Arguments** as follows:

1. *We will be less reliant on gas from abroad*
 - We select Topic 2 and Topic 3.
2. *Solar and wind power are less demanding on the environment*
 - We select Topic 4 and Topic 5.
3. *The view from homes will be polluted by windmills*
 - We select Topic 6.
4. *Making more wind turbines allows us to move away from nuclear energy*
 - We select 'No Topics apply', since there is no topics that involves nuclear energy

Here are some examples of things that are not arguments for or against the option of **putting wind turbines and solar panels on land to battle climate change**. If you encounter them as **Arguments**, you may indicate that `No Topics apply`.

1. "I think this is a ridiculous suggestion"
 - a. This is not an argument because it does not address the why question.
2. "I believe we should rely on nuclear energy instead"
 - a. This is not an argument because it mentions an alternative option, but does not motivate why the current option is or is not a good one.
3. "I have stated this before, it corresponds to my earlier answer"
 - a. This is not an argument because the text does not give the argument.
4. "Agreed, it does not apply here"
 - a. This is not an argument because the author is stating agreement, but not providing the argument

Annotation

The Annotation phase is to be performed by you, individually. You will be shown a list of **Arguments**, and the **Option** they relate to. We ask you to annotate these **Arguments** as described below.

Note! We are not asking for your personal opinion, but rather are interested in the content of the Argument as is.

Annotation workflow

Please follow these steps:

1. **Read Argument:** Read the Option, and the Arguments one-by-one; For each argument, you will also see their polarity (supporting "Pro" and opposing "Con") and a list of Topics. For a more complete description, see [Arguments & Topics](#).
2. **Topic selection:** Now you can:
 - Select Topics that **apply** to each **Argument** by clicking on individual Topics.
 - Indicate that no Topics apply to the **Argument**, by clicking the red '**No Topics apply**' button. In case the Argument is unclear to you, you also indicate that no topics apply.
2. Click the **Submit** button to submit your choices.

When to stop?

Please continue until you have made a selection for all Arguments. The platform will provide you with a button to return to Prolific.