

Instructions for HyENA experiment

Thank you for joining the HyENA experiment! The goal of this experiment is to identify key **Arguments** from a discourse. The analyzed discourse is opinions of Dutch residents in the context of covid-19. We ask you to create a list of **Arguments** in support of, or opposed to a proposed decision.

What you will be reading

In the HyENA experiment you will be reading comments stemming from answers to a questionnaire, where citizens were asked to provide feedback on potential government policies regarding the relaxation of the Covid-19 measures.

In the questionnaire, participants selected policy **Options** that the government considers. If a participant selected an **Option**, participants were invited to motivate their choice with a text comment, which we refer to as a **Motivation**. Additionally, the participants were asked to provide a **Motivation** against picking (some of) the remaining **Options**. Since the original **Motivations** were provided in Dutch, we have (automatically) translated them into English.

Motivations are written to justify choices. Analyzing them offers valuable insight into the opinions held by survey participants. You will be reading the **Motivations** in reply to a single **Option**. The **Motivation** might contain **Arguments** in favor, or opposed to the **Option** at hand.

Lifting corona measures in the Netherlands

The questionnaire was conducted in the Netherlands between 29/04/2020 and 06/05/2020, when partial lockdown measures were in place in the Netherlands. The government wanted to gauge the opinion of the citizens on the eight possible **Options**. Each proposed **Option** came with an additional pressure on the healthcare system as a consequence (percentage in parentheses):

- Nursing and care homes allow visitors. (10-25%)
- Businesses open again, except for hotels, restaurants, cafes and contact professions (barbers, beauticians, etc.). (6-15%)
- Employees in contact professions (barbers, beauticians, etc.) go back to work. (8-15%)
- Young people may come together in groups. (4-8%)
- All restrictions are lifted for people who are immune.) (10-20%)
- Restrictions are lifted in Friesland, Groningen and Drenthe (Northern regions less affected by the virus). (15-30%)
- Social contact within families is allowed again. (6-15%)
- Hotels, restaurants, cafes, and the entertainment industry re-open. (15-25%)

The question you will be answering in the annotation, is:

What arguments are relevant in the context of relaxing COVID-19 measures, for or against a single proposed relaxation measure?

Arguments

Arguments are an intuitive way for people to describe the tradeoffs of decision. More precisely, **Arguments** are opinions or pieces of evidence that support or object to a decision. They should also adhere to the following criteria:

- Arguments should be addressing a single point at the time.
- Arguments should have a logical structure, where they provide an answer to the *why question*: an argument gives a single reason for or against taking a specific action.
- Argument should be either in support of (Pro) or against a proposed **Option**.

You can use the following templates to help you in writing down the arguments. They are repeated on the web platform, as a guide.

For a Pro argument:

Based on this Motivation, a reason to support this Option is:

For a Con argument:

Based on this Motivation, a reason to refute this Option is:

Examples

Below, we give some example Motivations in quotation marks, their *arguments in italics* in the context of **putting wind turbines and solar panels on land to battle climate change**.

1. "With more wind and solar power we are less reliant on gas from abroad."
 - a. This is an argument because it gives a reason for **putting wind turbines and solar panels on land to battle climate change**, which is that *we will be less reliant on gas from abroad*.
 - b. Finishing the template: **putting wind turbines and solar panels on land to battle climate change** is a good idea, because *we will be less reliant on gas from abroad*
 - c. This is a **pro** argument.
2. "Wind and solar power are renewable energy sources rather than their fossil counterparts."
 - a. This is an argument because it gives a reason for **putting wind turbines and solar panels on land to battle climate change**, which is that *wind and solar power are renewable energy sources*.
 - b. Finishing the template: **putting wind turbines and solar panels on land to battle climate change** is a good idea, because *wind and solar power are renewable energy sources*.
 - c. This is a **pro** argument.
3. "Windmills on land require a lot of open space."
 - a. This is an argument because it gives a reason against **putting wind turbines and solar panels on land to battle climate change**, because *windmills require a lot of space*.
 - b. Finishing the template: **putting wind turbines and solar panels on land to battle climate change** is a bad idea, because *windmills require a lot of space*.

- c. This is a **con** argument.

Here are some examples of things that are not arguments for or against the option of **putting wind turbines and solar panels on land to battle climate change**.

1. "I think this is a ridiculous suggestion"
 - a. This is not an argument because it does not address the why question.
2. "I believe we should rely on nuclear energy instead"
 - a. This is not an argument because it mentions an alternative option, but does not motivate why the current option is or is not a good one.
3. "The website doesn't work"
 - a. This is not an argument because it is not related to the option.

Annotation

The Annotation phase is to be performed by you, individually. You will start with an empty list of arguments. You will be shown Motivations from residents, and the Option they made the Motivation for. The Motivation should contain arguments for or against the Option. We ask you to annotate these arguments as described below.

Note! We are not asking for your personal opinion, but rather are interested in the content of the Motivation.

Annotation workflow

Please follow the following steps

1. **Read new motivation:** Read the new Motivation; you see the English **Motivation** and the **Option** for which it was written.
Now you can:
 - Annotate with an action (argument addition / deletion) (see **Argument in motivation**)
 - Select an already existing argument (by clicking "Argument already annotated") (see **Argument already in my list**)
 - Indicate that no argument is present in the motivation using the red button. (see **No argument in motivation**)
2. **Argument in motivation?** Is there an argument to be found in the motivation? While trying to identify an argument, please answer these questions:
 - Does the argument give a reason for picking (or not picking) a particular choice?
 - Does the opinion address any of the "why" questions? Either "Why is choice A a good idea?" or "Why is choice A a bad idea?"
 - Does Argument address a single point?

If you answered 'yes' to all questions, please paraphrase and add the identified argument to the argument list (if not already present) using either the Pro or Con text box. In writing down arguments, make sure to follow the template hinted at earlier (in the **Arguments** section).

It might be the case that there are **multiple** Arguments made in the Motivation. In that case, for each of the arguments, repeat the procedure above.

3. **Argument already in my list?** A new motivation may not contain any new information with respect to your list of arguments, but rather repeat an argument you've already entered. In such a case, click on the blue "*Argument already annotated*" button and select the argument from the argument list. Next, close the selection window, and continue by clicking on "*Next Motivation*".
4. **No argument in motivation?** it may occur that it is impossible to extract an argument from the motivation, either because the Motivation contains no arguments, or you cannot understand the Motivation (if this happens, we ask you to click the "*Unclear Translation*" button below the comment). In such cases, click on the red button for *No Argument* before clicking on "*Next Motivation*".
5. **Move on to the next motivation:** You can click on a "*Next Motivation*" button only after having annotated the motivation you are currently shown.

When to stop?

Please continue until 50 Motivations have been annotated. The platform will provide you with a button to return to Prolific.